

Hubbard Elementary School (Arc-En-Ciel) & Hubbard Avenue Elementary School
Comparison Report

Hubbard Elementary School (Arc-En-Ciel)



Hubbard Avenue Elementary School



Report Prepared By

Shawn Tracey
Director of Finance and Administration
Anglophone West School District
April 2021

Comparison Report

Hubbard Elementary School is a Grade 3-5 school with approximately 320 students from the Town of Oromocto, Oromocto First Nation, Burton, Maugerville, Sheffield, and Geary. There are 22.5 teachers and 12 support staff. French Immersion is offered.

At the end of March 2021, Hubbard Avenue Elementary School staff and students moved to the former Ecole Arc-En-Ciel on Drummond Drive in Oromocto. The move was necessitated by a heating system that became deficient and required a complete replacement. The opportunity arose to install a new integral ventilation system with the replacement.

This work requires at least eight months to complete and could not roll out safely with the building occupied. Ecole Arc-En-Ciel was left vacant when staff and students moved into their new building in Oromocto West.

Typically when a school is closed, a sustainability study guides the process. This falls to Provincial Policy 409 – Multi-Year School Infrastructure Planning. The situation with Hubbard, however, is different. Section 2.3 of Policy 409 describes how a sustainability study is not required if structural failure exists. Such is the case with Hubbard Avenue School.

Although emergency funding has been approved to secure the new heating and ventilation system, there has been enough inquiry to call for us to examine whether the staff and students should remain at Ecole Arc-En-Ciel permanently. The Department of Education and Early Childhood Development has confirmed this option.

This report, which compares the two schools, was created to help inform the decision. To further support the decision-making process, there is a plan to consult with families, staff, Oromocto First Nations and other stakeholders.

A final decision will be made before the end of June. While the consultation process occurs, the renovations at Hubbard Avenue Elementary School have been placed on hold. This means that students and staff will stay at Arc-En-Ciel for the entire 2021-22 school year, at least.

Comments and input can be shared with Shawn Tracey, the Director of Finance and Administration for Anglophone West School District, by email at shawn.tracey@nbed.nb.ca .

Building Dynamics Analysis

Hubbard Avenue Elementary School

Hubbard Avenue Elementary School was built in 1957 and is a single-storey building. The building is 4039 square meters in size. The property size is 4.93 acres. The building is owned and maintained by Anglophone West School District.

The building is structurally sound and safe for students and staff (aside from the heating system). There are no cracks in the exterior brick and no signs of any structural integrity issues within the structure. The exterior walls are steel posts and beams infilled with masonry. The interior walls are primarily block-covered in plaster. Walls are showing their age.

The wall plaster at this school contains asbestos and is monitored in the District's Asbestos Management Plan. The asbestos is located in some classroom floor tile, pipe parching, and all the wall plaster in the school.

The interior walls, doors, and frames in 90% of the school require painting. There is surface bubbling in many areas of the plastered walls. The Terrazzo floors in hallways and bathrooms are in good condition. The classrooms have a combination of Vinyl Composite Tile and Sheet Flooring and a small storage room with 9X9 tiles and are all in good condition.

The roofing is ten years old, and we are starting to get a significant amount of air bubbles on the surfacing. The Department of Transportation and Infrastructure has been informed. They will be conducting annual inspections of roofing this summer and preparing a list of capital repairs for consideration to the Department of Education and Early Childhood Education's Facilities Branch.

Windows are aluminum frames with bottom sliders and are in good to fair condition. The exterior doors are aluminum, and they are all in good condition. Interior doors were replaced in 2010 along with locksets. Doors and hardware are all in good condition.

The school ceilings are a combination of T-bar, drywall, and 12X12 ceiling tiles, and they are all in good condition.

There is limited storage space available at the school. There would be space on-site for future development if portable classrooms were ever required due to increased enrolment. The fire support system in the school is strand pipes and fire extinguishers located throughout the school environment and are inspected.

The heating system at this school is gas-fired boilers, and the heating lines are in poor condition and need extensive repairs. There are no integral ventilation systems in the building other than exhaust fans in the washrooms at the school.

The school has 20 classrooms and a total functional capacity of 504 students. The gymnasium is 398 square meters in size, and the gym floors are in poor condition.

The school has a dedicated library space and a music room. There is no cafeteria in the school. There is an administration area with offices and circulation and some specialty rooms for First Nations staff, guidance, and Integrated Service Delivery. There is a Snoezelen room, as well, at the school.

The parking is sufficient for staff and parents, but the overall condition of the pavement is poor and requires patching and repairs.

There have been concerns around traffic flows at the school, and work has taken place with District Transportation, Facilities, and School staff to improve the flow and overall safety of the site.

The school has two playground areas, and the playground is well maintained and in good condition.

Capital Improvements have been completed over the years at the school in the amount of \$739,748.00. The projects that have been completed include fire integrity, washroom and changerooms, roofing, classroom doors, exiting improvements for fire safety, office improvements, & fire doors.

Presenting the outstanding capital repair work at the school is estimated at \$1.76 million. The projects include heating and ventilation upgrade, electrical upgrade, exterior wall repairs, flooring, electrical receptacles, site improvements, interior finishes, and wall repairs.

Operational Costs associated with the schools are a total of \$200,692.38. They are comprised of Heating (\$71,205.40), Snow Removal (\$6,400.02), Custodial Services (\$73,996.58), Electricity (\$17,948.55), Water & Sewer (\$6,653.40), Garbage Removal (\$2,019.21), Cleaning Supplies (\$1,736.50) & Minor Repairs (\$20,732.72).

We currently transport 238 students to school by bus. Twenty-four buses are serving the school and are loaded and dispatched at dismissal. The school is located 1.8 km from Assiniboine Avenue Elementary School and 1 km from Ridgeview Middle School. The parent's dropoff and pickup areas are separate from the bus loading zone.

There is a need for three network closets to bridge the mass distances to provide network connectivity to the building. The main closet is in the staff room located next to the main office above the photocopier. The second closet is in a custodial closet in the left-wing of the school. The third closet is in the right wing of the school near the library in a classroom closet. The locations of these closets are poor and not scalable for growth; new switch technology (Cisco 9300s) that we are now upgrading to in many of our schools will not physically fit in either of the 3 locations currently.

The cabling of Hubbard 1.0 is primarily made up of Cat5E and some Cat6 cabling. The old cabling is not installed to standard and is dated; it is due for an upgrade.

The wireless access points are currently located in the hallways of the school, and this does not provide the school with adequate coverage nor support a 1-to-1 initiative. This installation work was completed this way a long time ago because of asbestos in the drywall. Drywall extends to the metal roofing, and therefore a hole is required for each classroom to pass the cabling through, requiring the hiring of an asbestos abatement company.

Though the school has a few new projectors and a couple of MX Boards, most of the technology in the school is dated and needs to be replaced. Because of the chalkboard built-ins and the impact of asbestos, the installations of this hardware is not ideal and, in many cases, is installed on plywood buildouts from the wall. Though it is functional, it would be preferred to have the built-ins removed and proper installation of projector and screens.

The school raised funds a couple of years ago and invested heavily into a projector and rear-projected screen for use in the gymnasium; it works wonderfully and is used often by the school.

The public address system is functional but old technology and will need to be upgraded in the future.

The door access system is dated and static. Static means it is a system on its own that requires someone from facilities or a security company to touch the door codes to manage them.

There are 9 security cameras installed at the back of the school. They record to a memory chip within the camera. There is no central Network Video Recorder.

Hubbard Elementary School (Arc-En-Ciel)

Hubbard Elementary School (former Arc-En-Ciel) was built in 1957 and is a two-storey building. The building is 3068 square meters in size. The property size is 3.96 acres. The building is owned and maintained by Francophone South School District and presently under the care and control of Anglophone West School District.

The building is structurally sound and safe for students and staff. There are no cracks in the exterior brick and no signs of any structural integrity issues within the structure. The exterior walls are steel beams, posts, and girders infilled with masonry and IFIS (stucco) and are in good condition. The interior walls are masonry block and drywall. Walls were 55% painted before the move-in of current staff and students, but the rest of the school walls will require refreshing in the future.

The only source of asbestos is located in the joint compound in room 234 in the school and is monitored in the District's Asbestos Management Plan in consultation with Francophone South Facilities Team.

The Terrazzo floors in hallways and bathrooms are in good condition. The classrooms have a combination of 12x12 Vinyl tiles and Sheet Flooring and are all in good condition.

The roofing is ten years old over the classroom wing and in good condition. The roofing over the gymnasium is older and in fair condition. The Department of Transportation and Infrastructure will be conducting annual inspections of roofing this summer and prepare a list of capital repairs for consideration to the Department of Education and Early Childhood Education's Facilities Branch.

Windows are aluminum frames with bottom sliders and are in good condition, but most are missing screens. The exterior doors are aluminum, and they are all in good condition. Interior doors are the original wood doors and are in fair condition. Door hardware is older, and they present a challenge in keying these locks similar to other Oromocto schools. We are still able to source parts for these older door sets.

The school ceilings are assorted with T-bar in the hallway & old music room, and they are in good condition. The classrooms have 12x12 tiles that are in good to fair condition. There are also a few drywall ceilings that are in good condition.

There is an adequate storage room at the school. There would be space on-site for future development if portable classrooms were ever required due to increased enrolment. The fire support system in the school is strand pipes, and fire extinguishers located throughout the school environment are inspected.

The heating system at this school is a system of gas-fired boilers and is in good condition. There is an air handler in the gymnasium. There is a fresh air supply and exhaust to each classroom and the washrooms in the school.

The school has 18 classrooms and a total functional capacity of 462 students. The gymnasium is 343 square meters in size, and the floors are in poor condition and need to be refinished and lined.

The school has a dedicated library space and a music room. There is a cafeteria space in the school with a full-service kitchen. There is an administration area with offices and circulation and a room for First Nations staff. There is one small space for Resource & Guidance. Presently, they are short one space for Resource & Guidance.

The parking is sufficient in size for staff and parents. One parking lot is in very poor condition and will require some improvements.

There are some signage requirements for traffic flow, school zone, and crosswalk signage that will need to be added to the site and street to improve safety.

The school has a huge playground in fair condition. Many structures need to be appropriately reset in the ground and have moved over the years due to frost. Some of the structures are owned by the New Arc-En-Ciel and we are working to identify those structures and when they will be moved to the new school site. They are not owned by the Town of Oromocto.

Capital Improvements have been completed over the years at the school in the amount of \$731,611. These projects were comprised of roofing, site improvements, electrical upgrades, fire prevention, interior improvements, accessibility improvements, heating and ventilation, and modular classroom repairs.

Presenting the outstanding capital repair work at the school is estimated at \$1.48 million. The projects consist of ventilation improvements, field improvements, windows improvements, technology lab, library improvements, gym floor repairs, interior finishes, interior improvements, and fire integrity.

Operational Costs associated with the schools are a total of \$177,011.58. They are comprised of Heating (\$32,164), Snow Removal (\$9,500), Custodial Services (\$73,996, this is estimated the same as the other school, but the old Arc-En-Ciel was cleaned by CUPE staff), Electricity (\$37,515), Water & Sewer (\$3,503), Garbage Removal (\$1,554.), Cleaning Supplies (\$7,117) & Minor Repairs (\$11,662).

We currently transport 295 students to school by bus. Twenty-four buses are serving the school and are loaded and dispatched at dismissal. Seven busses can load at one time at the new site. The school is

located 1.7 km from Assiniboine Avenue Elementary School and 2.5 km from Ridgeview Middle School. The parent's dropoff and pickup areas are separate from the bus loading zone.

The school is serviced with one network closet, central in the building on the first floor.

The cabling is Primary Cat5E and is due for an upgrade. The cabling installs, for the most part, are to standards with a proper rack system. With it being a 1 central closet school, the cost of an upgrade is much more cost-efficient. There is no Asbestos to deal with and no need to relocate and build new closets. Newer technology network switches will fit without issue. Every classroom has an Access Point installed and is 1-to-1 ready.

Every classroom is outfitted with a New Projector, 100" Power Screen, and Juno sound system. The classrooms have built-ins that make the installation of screens and projectors more difficult. The installation's scope was temporary as the amount of time for transition was limited.

Currently, there is no projection system or sound system in the gymnasium; the school has recently identified this as a need.

The public address system has been upgraded and is new to the building.

Though the school has a new door intercom, it should have an upgraded door access system such as Salto.

The school has no security system cameras.

Enrolment Forecast

Total		Regular Program			District Program(s)	Self Contained Special Ed.
Year	3	4	5	Total		
2016	115	82	101	298		
2017	108	110	88	306		
2018	103	105	114	322		
2019	112	96	110	318		
2020	111	114	96	321		

Enrolment Projections						
Total		Regular Program			District Program(s)	Self Contained Special Ed.
	3	4	5	Total	FTE Staff	
2021	105	110	119	334		
2022	122	104	116	342		
2023	106	122	108	336		
2024	100	105	127	332		
2025	114	99	110	323		
2026	94	112	103	309		
2027	104	93	117	314		
2028	96	103	96	295		
2029	93	95	107	295		
2030	92	92	99	283		

Building	Hubbard Elementary (Arc-En-Ciel)	Hubbard Avenue
Age	1957	1957
Structure: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integrity • Walls • Paint • Floors • Roofs • Windows • Doors • Ceilings • Asbestos 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structurally Sound, Two Storey Building • Exterior - Good Condition • Interior - Masonry Block/Drywall • 45% Needs Re-painted • Good Condition • Good – Fair Condition - 10 Years Old • Good Condition – Aluminum Frame/Bottom Sliders/Some Missing Screens • Exterior - Good Condition • Interior – Fair Condition • T-bar/Tile – Good Condition • Joint Compound in Room 234 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structurally Sound, One Storey Building • Exterior – Good Condition • Interior – Block Covered in Plaster/Showing Age • 90% Needs Re-painted • Good Condition • Fair Condition (Surface Bubbling) – 10 Years Old • Good to Fair Condition – Aluminum Frame/Bottom Sliders • Exterior - Good Condition • Interior – Good Condition • T-bar/Drywall/Tile – Good Condition • Wall Plaster in some classroom floor tile, pipe parching and all wall plaster in school
Building Size	3068 Square Meters	4039 Square Meters
Property Size	3.96 Acres	4.93 Acres
Access to Storage	Adequate Storage Room	Limited Storage Space
Ownership	Francophone South School District	Anglophone West School District
Recent Capital Improvements: 10 years	\$ 731,611 Roofing, Site Improvements, Electrical Upgrades, Fire Prevention, Interior Improvements, Accessibility Improvements, Heating & Ventilation, and Modular Classroom Repairs	\$ 739,748 Roofing, Fire Integrity, Washrooms, Change Rooms, Classroom Doors, Exiting Improvements for Fire Safety, Office Improvements and Fire Doors

Number of Classrooms	18	20
Functional Capacity	462 Students	504 Students
Gymnasium	343 Square Meters	398 Square Meters
Gymnasium Floors	Poor Condition	Poor Condition
Library	Yes: Shared Space	Yes: Shared Space
Cafeteria	Yes	No
Music Room	Yes: Shared Space	Yes: Shared Space
Administration Office Space	Yes	Yes
Specialty Teacher Office Space	Yes, limited	Yes
Staff Rooms	Small	Yes: potential change if ventilation project proceeds
Specialty Rooms for Student Services	Yes, limited	Yes
Washrooms	2 Boys, 2 Girls, 3 Staff, 1 single-use with wheelchair accessibility. There are change rooms as well with washrooms adjacent to the gymnasium	4 Boys with accessibility, 4 Girls with accessibility, 2 Staff, 1 single-use no wheelchair accessibility.
Safety	Safe for Students & Staff	Safe for Students & Staff
Playground	One in Fair Condition	Two in Good Condition
Heating	Gas-fired Boilers in Good Condition	Needed
Ventilation	Air Handler in Gym/Fresh Air & Exhaust in Classrooms & Washrooms	Needed
Technology Infrastructure	One Network Closet in Central Location. Cabling is Due for an Upgrade. Wireless Access Points are installed in every classroom. Technology is Good, but Gym Needs Projection Screen and Sound System. PA System is New. School Has No Security Cameras.	Three Network Closets in Poor Locations and limited Access for Growth. Cabling is Due for an Upgrade. Wireless Access Points are Dated and Needs Upgrades. Technology is Dated and Needs Upgrades. PA system is functional but upgrading is preferred. School has 9 Security Cameras
Accessibility	Elevator	Single Level
Fire Code	Strand Pipes and Fire Extinguishers	Strand Pipes and Fire Extinguishers
Parking	Size – Sufficient Lot – Poor Condition	Size – Sufficient Lot – Poor Condition
Ease of Additions (Site Manageability)	Yes – Will Accommodate Portable Classrooms	Yes – Will Accommodate Portable Classrooms

Finances	Hubbard Elementary (Arc En Ceil)	Hubbard Avenue
Operational Costs	\$ 177,011	\$ 200,692
Heating	\$ 32,164	\$ 71,205
Snow Removal	\$ 9,500	\$ 6,400
Custodial Services	\$ 73,996	\$ 73,996
Electricity	\$ 37,515	\$ 17,948
Water & Sewage	\$ 3,503	\$ 6,653
Garbage Removal	\$ 1,554	\$ 2,019
Cleaning Supplies	\$ 7,117	\$ 1,736
Minor Repairs	\$ 11,662	\$ 20,732
Capital Allowance	\$1.48 M - Needed	\$1.76 M - Needed
Transportation	Hubbard Elementary (Arc-En-Ciel)	Hubbard Avenue
Number of Students Requiring Busing	295 Students / 24 Buses includes OFN bus	238 Students / 24 Buses includes OFN bus
Complexity of Busing	Signage Needed	Concerns of Traffic Flow
Bus Loading Zones	10 Buses - 7 Buses Can Load at One Time. Parent Location is Separate.	10 Buses Are Dispatched to Load. Parent Location is Separate.
Impact on Neighbourhood	Hubbard Elementary (Arc-En-Ciel)	Hubbard Avenue
Distance from Assiniboine	1.7 km	1.8 km
Distance from Ridgeview	2.5 km	1 km
Traffic Patterns	Signage Needed	Concerns of Traffic Flow