

## **Sustainability Study – Bath Middle School Financial Comparisons**

In order to do some financial comparisons, we need to consider the “What If” scenarios that would be most likely if the District Education Council voted in favor of closing the school and the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Development approved the movement of students to another location. The two “What If” scenarios for this particular study are:

- A) Move students from Bath Middle School to Florenceville Middle School
- B) Combine students from Bath Middle School and Bath Elementary School, in Bath Middle School

### **Staffing Information and Implications**

- Teacher staffing is conducted based on a series of formulas that are related to student enrolment
- In reviewing the numbers, we used enrolment from the Spring of 2014
- Classroom FTE (Full Time Equivalent; number of teachers) is assigned by formula, knowing that there is a maximum class size for classrooms as indicated in the Teacher’s Collective Agreement
  - 1.1 FTE per classroom at the elementary level
  - 1.2 FTE per classroom at the middle level
  - 1.0 FTE per 12.4 students for first 100 at high school level (minimum 5.0 FTE)
  - 1.0 FTE per 19.7 students for next 300 at high school level
- Guidance FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 502 students (topped up where it can be)
- Resource FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 180 students (topped up where it can be)
- Administration FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 275 students (topped up where it can be)
- The number of school administrators is assigned according to the number of teachers; 1 principal is provided to a school with less than 12.6 FTE, 1 principal and 1 vice-principal is provided to a school with more than 12.6 FTE but less than 37.5 FTE
- Top ups in FTE are assessed year to year and this practice would not change; evidence of this is found in Appendix A, as noted in red
- Education Assistants are assigned based on need and on an annual basis
- Library Assistants are assigned based on a formula of 1.0 per 1000 students; it is based on a 36.25 hour work week, so part time library assistants are most common (there are times when a public library is within the school and a Library Assistant is not under Education)
- Administrative Assistants are assigned at a minimum of one full-time per school (36.25 hours per week), with top-up for larger schools

- Custodial Staff are assigned based on square footage of the facility
- All staff are paid based on scales within their collective agreements
- Principals and vice-principals are paid a responsibility allowance (based on enrolment and years of experience in the position)
- Please see Appendix A for data on staff
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario A:
  - \$14 192 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
  - \$39 811 due to 0.6 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
  - \$1765 due to 2.25 hrs/week less library assistant at \$17.67/hr for 39 weeks, including employer costs
  - \$34 916 due to one less administrative assistant, including employer costs
  - \$71 868 due to 1.75 less custodian at \$17.75/hr for 30.5 hours for 52 weeks and \$18.64/hr for 40 hours for 52 weeks, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario A is **\$162 552**
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario B:
  - \$14 192 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
  - <-\$7121> due to the addition of one vice-principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
  - \$33 175 due to 0.5 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
  - \$1569 due to 2 hrs/week less library assistant at \$17.67/hr for 39 weeks, including employer costs
  - \$34 916 due to one less administrative assistant, including employer costs
  - \$43 613 due to 1.1 less custodian at \$17.75/hr for 44 hours for 52 weeks, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario B is **\$120 344**

### Global School Budgets

- Global school budgets are assigned on an annual basis according to a number of different formulas and to support student learning
- Since amalgamation, we have adjusted school budgets to ensure that significant decreases do not occur all at once; there is a considerable top up for Bath Middle School and a smaller top up for Florenceville Middle School. Bath Elementary School was not topped up as it's budget calculations came out to be an amount that is workable ; the amount of top up can be reduced if the two schools were together (in either scenario)
- Please see Appendix B and C for details on global school budgets and potential savings; this is data from the 2014-15 fiscal year

- Total annual savings from global school budgets are
  - Scenario A – \$4259
  - Scenario B – \$4444

#### Facility Budgets

- Facility budgets are provided to schools to cover costs of operating the building
- Please see Appendix B and C for 2013-14 actual costs and a comparison with what estimated costs would be for the “What If” scenarios
- Total annual savings from facilities budgets are
  - Scenario A – \$87 867
  - Scenario B – \$57 821

#### Transportation Costs

Scenario A would see the need to add to the bus run. This cost is approximated at \$6000.

Scenario B would no change in transportation practices, so no change in cost...\$0.

Bussing routes are reviewed regularly to ensure efficiency is balanced with reasonable drives.

#### Capital Improvement Avoidance

- Schools have a number of projects listed on the Capital Improvement Project database. Each year, a number of projects are prioritized and submitted to government for approval
- If a school were to close, the projects would then not be necessary to stay on the list for consideration
- Projects vary in terms of priority/need; some are necessary in a timely manner and some are not; some projects may be for aesthetic improvement as well
- The capital improvements currently on the list for Bath Middle School include:
  - Completion of exterior window replacements
  - Paving of areas around the school where asphalt has deteriorated
  - Replacing six sets of exterior doors
  - Renovating entrance stairways with hard tile
  - Renovating and upgrading bathrooms
  - Electrical panel upgrades
  - Replacing boilers
- These projects amount to approximately \$525 000

- The capital improvements currently on the list for Bath Elementary School include:
  - Completion of outside door improvements, including automatic openers
  - Paving of areas around the school where asphalt has deteriorated
  - Installing a lift/elevator
  - Renovating the bathrooms
  - Installing new tile floors
  - Electrical panel upgrades
  - Replacing piping in the boiler room
  - Installing a ventilation system
  
- These projects amount to approximately \$1 080 630

#### TOTAL ANNUAL SAVINGS

- SCENARIO A – \$248 678 (BMS students move to Florenceville Middle School for a 6-8 setting)
- SCENARIO B – \$182 609 (BES students move to Bath Middle School for a K-8 setting)

#### ONE-TIME COST AVOIDANCE

- SCENARIO A - \$525 000 (because Bath Middle School as a building would close)
- SCENARIO B - \$1 080 630 (because Bath Elementary School as a building would close)

#### RENOVATIONS

For Scenario A, no renovations would be required. The Bath Middle School Students could move into Florenceville Middle School without a change to Florenceville Middle School.

For Scenario B, there could be some slight renovations required. An initial look shows that 10 classrooms could fit and the McCain Center and After School Room could remain. If an 11<sup>th</sup> classroom was needed, there would be a need to share the After School Room with another room. District Mentors and Early Childhood West officials would need to relocate. The Home-Economics room would be required as a classroom. 2 computer labs would need to merge into one, adjacent to the shop. The staff room and resource areas would need to reduce to half their current sizes, although this would leave the resource room at the current educational specification for new schools. The library could remain intact (computers here??). These are all “rough looks” and if K-8 was the choice in Bath Middle School, the principals would be engaged for mapping things out more precisely. Costs, at first glance, would be less than \$10 000. This number could climb higher if things were uncovered along the way. A detailed estimate would be required.

# Appendix A

School	Enrollment	Classroom FTE	Guidance (Formula)	Guidance	Resource (Formula)	Resource	Administration (Formula)	Administration	Education Assistants	Library Assistants	Administrative Assistants	Cleaning Staff
Bath Middle	44	2.4	0.09	0.3	0.24	0.4	0.16	0.4	2	2.25 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~1.75
Bath Elementary	142	8.8	0.28	0.4	0.79	1.0	0.52	0.5	4	6.5 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~1.1
Florenceville Middle	196	12	0.39	0.6	1.09	1.0	0.71	1.0	4	9.75 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~2.2
What if ...												
Bath (K-9)	186	11.2	0.37	0.7	1.03	1.0	0.68	0.8	6	6.75 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~1.75
Bath/Florenceville Middle	240	14.4	0.48	0.6	1.33	1.4	0.87	1.1	6	9.75 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~2.2

# Anglophone West School District

Appendix B

## School: Bath Middle

### Scenario 1

Cost Centers	Bath Middle Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15		Bath Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15		Florence, Middle Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15		Florence, Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15		Bath/Florence Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15 IF THEY WERE TOGETHER		Bath/Florence Est. Actual Fiscal Year		Enrollment Based Difference		Estimated Actual Difference		How Budget Amount is Assigned - Comments	
	Bath Middle Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15	Florence, Middle Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Florence, Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath/Florence Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Florence, Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath/Florence Est. Actual Fiscal Year	Bath/Florence Actual Fiscal Year	Bath/Florence Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath/Florence Est. Actual Fiscal Year	Enrollment Based Difference	Estimated Actual Difference	How Budget Amount is Assigned - Comments					
<b>Assigned Budgets</b>																		
Regular Instruction	3,564	7,636	17,821	20,192	21,385	20,192	27,628	21,385	27,628	-	200	200	-	200	200	200	Based on enrollment and any adjustments	
Admin.Support	879	1,884	4,397	4,982	5,277	4,982	5,667	5,277	5,667	-	1,200	1,200	-	1,200	1,200	1,200	Based on enrollment and any adjustments	
Library																		
Teachers Working Conditions	1,540	1,540	2,486	2,486	2,660	2,486	2,660	2,660	2,660	1,366	1,366	1,366	-	1,366	1,366	1,366	Amt per school plus amt per teacher	
Nutrition																		Based on enrollment
Bilingual Learning Environ.																		
Wellness Grant	1,493	1,493	1,839	1,839	1,839	1,839	1,839	1,839	1,839	1,493	1,493	1,493	-	1,493	1,493	1,493	Based on proposal to WCS	
Positive Learning																		
Co/Extra Trips	185	397	926	1,049	1,111	1,049	1,446	1,111	1,446	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	Based on enrollment and any adjustments	
PSSC	124	124	618	618	742	618	742	742	742	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	Based on enrollment	
<b>Total</b>	<b>7,785</b>	<b>13,074</b>	<b>28,088</b>	<b>31,167</b>	<b>33,015</b>	<b>31,167</b>	<b>39,982</b>	<b>33,015</b>	<b>39,982</b>	<b>2,858</b>	<b>4,259</b>	<b>4,259</b>	<b>2,858</b>	<b>4,259</b>	<b>4,259</b>	<b>4,259</b>		

Facilities Costs	Bath Middle Actual Costs 2013-14		Florence Middle Actual Costs 2013-14		Bath/Florence Est Future Costs If School Closed		Estimated Savings If School Closed		Comments
	Bath Middle Actual Costs 2013-14	Florence Middle Actual Costs 2013-14	Bath/Florence Est Future Costs If School Closed	Bath/Florence Est Future Costs If School Closed	Estimated Savings If School Closed	Estimated Savings If School Closed			
Electricity & Heating Fuel	56,588	85,043	86,000	86,000	55,631	55,631			
Water & Sewer	9,415	7,003	7,003	7,003	9,415	9,415			
Garbage Removal	2,340	4,140	4,080	4,080	2,340	2,340		Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure	
Ground Maintenance	3,680	5,500	7,750	7,750	3,680	3,680		Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure	
Cleaning Supplies	2,406	4,241	4,600	4,600	2,047	2,047			
Minor Repairs	16,661	19,094	21,000	21,000	14,754	14,754			
<b>Total</b>	<b>91,090</b>	<b>125,020</b>	<b>130,433</b>	<b>130,433</b>	<b>87,867</b>	<b>87,867</b>			

# Appendix C

## School: Bath Middle

### Scenario 2

Cost Centers	Bath Middle Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15		Bath Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15		Bath Elem Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15		Bath Elem Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15		Bath K-8 Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15 IF THEY WERE TOGETHER		Bath K-8 Est Actual Fiscal Year		Enrollment Based Difference		Estimated Actual Difference		How Budget Amount is Assigned - Comments
	Bath Middle Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath Middle Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath Elem Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath Elem Actual Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath K-8 Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath K-8 Est Actual Fiscal Year	Bath K-8 Enrollment Based Fiscal Year 2014-15	Bath K-8 Est Actual Fiscal Year	Bath K-8 Enrollment Based Difference	Bath K-8 Est Actual Fiscal Year	Bath K-8 Enrollment Based Difference	Estimated Actual Difference	How Budget Amount is Assigned - Comments				
<b>Assigned Budgets</b>																	
Regular Instruction	3,564	7,636	12,171	12,171	15,735	19,507	15,735	19,507	-	300	Based on enrollment and any adjustments						
Admin.Support	879	1,884	3,003	3,003	3,883	3,387	3,883	3,387	-	1,500.00	Based on enrollment and any adjustments						
Library	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-						
Teachers Working Conditions	1,540	1,540	2,096	2,096	2,345	2,345	2,345	2,345	1,291	1,291	Amt per school plus amt per teacher						
Nutrition	-	-	1,300	1,300	1,300	1,300	1,300	1,300	-	-	Based on enrollment						
Bilingual Learning Environ.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-						
Wellness Grant	1,493	1,493	1,354	1,354	1,493	1,493	1,493	1,493	1,354	1,354	Based on proposal to WCS						
Positive Learning	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-						
Co/Extra Trips	185	397	632	632	817	1,029	817	1,029	0	0	Based on enrollment and any adjustments						
PSSC	124	124	422	422	546	546	546	546	0	0	Based on enrollment						
<b>Total</b>	<b>7,785</b>	<b>13,074</b>	<b>20,978</b>	<b>20,978</b>	<b>26,119</b>	<b>29,608</b>	<b>26,119</b>	<b>29,608</b>	<b>2,644</b>	<b>4,444</b>							

Facilities Costs	Bath Middle Actual Costs 2013-14		Bath Elem Actual Costs 2013-14		Bath K-8 Est Future Costs		Estimated Savings		Comments
	Bath Middle Actual Costs 2013-14	Bath Elem Actual Costs 2013-14	Bath K-8 Est Future Costs	Estimated Savings	Bath K-8 Est Future Costs	Estimated Savings			
Electricity	56,588	39,979	58,000	38,567					
Water & Sewer	9,415	7,040	9,415	7,040					
Garbage Removal	2,340	2,040	4,080	2,040					Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure
Ground Maintenance	3,680	-	4,970	-					Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure
Cleaning Supplies	2,406	2,543	2,700	2,249					
Minor Repairs	16,661	10,264	19,000	7,925					
<b>Total</b>	<b>91,090</b>	<b>61,867</b>	<b>98,165</b>	<b>57,821</b>					