

Sustainability Study - Coles Island School Financial Comparisons

In order to do some financial comparisons, we need to consider the “What If” scenarios that would be most likely if the District Education Council voted in favor of closing the school and the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Development approved the movement of students to another location. The two “What If” scenarios for this particular study are:

- A) Move students from Coles Island School to Chipman Elementary School
- B) Move students from Coles Island School to Cambridge-Narrows Community School

Staffing Information and Implications

- Teacher staffing is conducted based on a series of formulas that are related to student enrolment
- In reviewing the numbers, we used enrolment from the Spring of 2014
- Classroom FTE (Full Time Equivalent; number of teachers) is assigned by formula, knowing that there is a maximum class size for classrooms as indicated in the Teacher’s Collective Agreement
 - 1.1 FTE per classroom at the elementary level
 - 1.2 FTE per classroom at the middle level
 - 1.0 FTE per 12.4 students for first 100 at high school level (minimum 5.0 FTE)
 - 1.0 FTE per 19.7 students for next 300 at high school level
- Guidance FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 502 students (topped up where it can be)
- Resource FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 180 students (topped up where it can be)
- Administration FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 275 students (topped up where it can be)
- The number of school administrators is assigned according to the number of teachers; 1 principal is provided to a school with less than 12.6 FTE, 1 principal and 1 vice-principal is provided to a school with more than 12.6 FTE but less than 37.5 FTE
- Top ups in FTE are assessed year to year and this practice would not change
- Education Assistants are assigned based on need and on an annual basis
- Library Assistants are assigned based on a formula of 1.0 per 1000 students; it is based on a 36.25 hour work week, so part time library assistants are most common (there are times when a public library is within the school and a Library Assistant is not under Education)
- Administrative Assistants are assigned at a minimum of one full-time per school (36.25 hours per week), with top-up for larger schools
- Custodial Staff are assigned based on square footage of the facility

- All staff are paid based on scales within their collective agreements
- Principals and vice-principals are paid a responsibility allowance (based on enrolment and years of experience in the position)
- Please see Appendix A for data on staff
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario A:
 - \$14 192 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
 - \$164 012 due to 2.5 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
 - \$1394 due to 1.75 hrs/week less library assistant at \$17.67/hr for 39 weeks, including employer costs
 - \$34 916 due to one less administrative assistant who works 10 months per year
 - \$39 519 due to one less custodian at \$17.75/hr for 40 hours for 52 weeks, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario A is **\$254 033**
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario B:
 - \$14 192 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
 - \$98 540 due to 1.5 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
 - \$1394 due to 1.75 hrs/week less library assistant at \$17.67/hr for 39 weeks, including employer costs
 - \$34 916 due to one less administrative assistant who works 10 months per year
 - \$39 519 due to one less custodian at \$17.75/hr for 40 hours for 52 weeks, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario B is **\$188 561**

Global School Budgets

- Global school budgets are assigned on an annual basis according to a number of different formulas and to support student learning
- Since amalgamation, we have adjusted school budgets to ensure that significant decreases do not occur all at once; there is a considerable top up for Coles Island and a smaller top up for Chipman Elementary and Cambridge-Narrows; the amount of top up can be reduced if the two schools were together (in either scenario)
- Please see Appendix B and C for details on global school budgets and potential savings; this is data from the 2014-15 fiscal year
- Total annual savings from global school budgets are
 - Scenario A – \$4819
 - Scenario B – \$4686

Facility Budgets

- Facility budgets are provided to schools to cover costs of operating the building
- Please see Appendix B and C for 2013-14 actual costs and a comparison with what estimated costs would be for the "What If" scenarios
- Total annual savings from facilities budgets are
 - Scenario A – \$49 129
 - Scenario B – \$49 495

Transportation Costs

Scenario A would see the need to add to the bus run. This cost is approximated at \$6500.

Scenario B would see the need to add to the bus run if only the K-5 students went to CNCS and the secondary kids continued to go to CFAS. This cost is approximated at \$35 000 (because a new driver and bus would need to be added). If all the students went to CNC-S (from K to 12), then the cost would be \$500.

Bussing routes are reviewed regularly to ensure efficiency is balanced with reasonable drives.

Capital Improvement Avoidance

- Schools have a number of projects listed on the Capital Improvement Project database. Each year, a number of projects are prioritized and submitted to government for approval
- If the school were to close, the projects would then not be necessary to stay on the list for consideration
- Projects vary in terms of priority/need; some are necessary in a timely manner and some are not; some projects may be for aesthetic improvement as well
- The capital improvements currently on the list for Coles Island include:
 - Fire Code Improvement to stairwell enclosure at main entrance
 - Heating and ventilation system in the main portion of the school
 - Curbing and driveway refinishing
- These projects amount to approximately \$289 000

TOTAL ANNUAL SAVINGS

- SCENARIO A – \$301 481
- SCENARIO B – \$207 742 to \$242 242

ONE-TIME COST AVOIDANCE

- \$289 000

Special Note

The idea of moving students to Sussex Elementary School was also mentioned, should the DEC vote in favour of making the recommendation to close Coles Island School and the Minister were to approve it.

Whereas Sussex Elementary School belongs to the Anglophone South School District, this could occur in one of two ways:

- A change in legislation under the Regulations of the Education Act (school boundaries)
- An agreement between the two superintendents as per Provincial Policy 319A

The distance to Sussex is comparable to the distance to CNCS, roughly, although every student shows that they live closer to CNCS than to Sussex.

In fact, the financial comparison would be relatively the same as CNCS, based on estimations.

Savings would incur through:

- One less principal responsibility allowance (\$14 192)
- Approximately 1.5 FTE based on an estimation from the 2013-14 provincial statistics (\$98 540)
- 1.75 hours of library assistant time (\$1394)
- 1.0 Administrative Assistant (\$34 916)
- 1.0 Cleaning Staff (\$39 519)
- School budget is difficult to predict, so would compare to the calculation of CNCS (\$4686)
- Facility budget is difficult to predict, so would compare to the calculation of CNCS (\$49 495)
- Transportation is difficult to predict, so would compare to the calculation of CNCS (-\$500 to -\$35 000)

Total Savings: \$207 742 to \$242 242

Appendix A

School	Enrolment	Classroom FTE	Guidance (Formula)	Guidance	Resource (Formula)	Resource	Administration (Formula)	Administration	Education Assistants	Library Assistants	Administrative Assistants	Cleaning Staff
Coles Island	27	3.3	0.05	0.1	0.15	0.2	0.10	0.4	1	1.75 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	1
Chipman Elementary	106	6.6	0.21	0.2	0.59	0.7	0.39	0.5	4	6.0 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~1.5
Cambridge Narrows	136	11.8	0.27	0.8	0.76	0.8	0.49	0.8	1	7.0 hrs. / week	1 (12 mos)	2
What if...												
Coles Island / Chipman	133	7.7	0.26	0.3	0.74	0.9	0.48	0.6	5	6.0 hrs. / week	1 (10 mos)	~1.5
Coles Island / Cambridge Narrows	163	14.0	0.32	0.8	0.91	1.0	0.59	0.9	2	7.0 hrs. / week	1 (12 mos)	2

School: Coles Island

Scenario 1

Cost Centers	Coles Island Enrollment Based Fiscal Year		Coles Island Actual Fiscal Year		Chipman Elem Enrollment Based Fiscal Year		Chipman Elem Actual Fiscal Year		CJ/CES Enrollment Based Fiscal Year		CJ/CES Est Actual Fiscal Year		Enrollment Based Difference	Estimated Actual Difference	How Budget Amount is Assigned - Comments
	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15	2014-15			
Assigned Budgets															
Regular Instruction	2,434	6,689	9,650	11,237	12,084	17,526	2,773	2,773	2,982	2,723	1,997	1,700	-	400	Based on enrollment and any adjustments
Admin.Support	601	1,651	2,381	2,773	2,982	2,723	-	-	-	-	1,997	1,700	-	1,700	Based on enrollment and any adjustments
Library	-	-	-	-	-	-	1,972	1,972	1,291	1,291	1,291	1,565	1,565	1,565	Am't per school plus amt per teacher
Teachers Working Conditions	1,590	1,590	1,972	1,972	1,997	1,997	1,031	1,031	1,291	1,291	1,291	-	-	-	Based on enrollment
Nutrition	260	260	1,031	1,031	1,291	1,291	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Bilingual Learning Environ.	-	-	-	-	-	-	1,304	1,304	1,304	1,304	1,304	1,154	1,154	1,154	Based on proposal to WCS
Wellness Grant	1,153	1,153	1,304	1,304	1,304	1,304	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Positive Learning	-	-	-	-	-	-	584	584	628	931	931	-	-	-	Based on enrollment and any adjustments
Co/Extra Trips	126	347	501	-	628	-	335	335	419	419	419	-	-	-	Based on enrollment
PSSC	84	84	335	335	419	419	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	6,249	11,775	17,174	19,235	20,764	26,192	19,235	19,235	20,764	26,192	26,192	2,718	2,718	4,819	

Facilities Costs	Coles Island Actual Costs		Chipman Elem Actual Costs		CJ/CES Est Future Costs		Estimated Savings		Comments
	2013-14	2013-14	2013-14	2013-14	Est Future Costs If School Closed	Estimated Savings If School Closed	Estimated Savings If School Closed		
Electricity & Heating Fuel	30,138	37,489	38,000	29,627					
Water & Sewer	-	2,945	2,945	-					
Garbage Removal	1,912	2,765	2,900	1,912					Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure
Ground Maintenance	5,952	7,600	9,646	5,952					Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure
Cleaning Supplies	359	1,779	1,980	158					
Minor Repairs	12,473	10,007	11,000	11,480					
Total	50,834	62,586	66,471	49,129					

Appendix C

School: Coles Island

Scenario 2

Cost Centers	Coles Island Enrollment Based		Coles Island Actual		CNCs Enrollment Based		CNCs Actual		C/CNCs Enrollment Based		C/CNCs Actual		How Budget Amount is Assigned - Comments
	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	Fiscal Year 2014-15	
Assigned Budgets													
Regular Instruction	2,434	6,689	12,692	14,243	15,126	20,533					400		Based on enrollment and any adjustments
Admin.Support	601	1,651	3,132	3,515	3,732	3,465					1,700		Based on enrollment and any adjustments
Library	-	-	-	-	-	-					-		
Teachers Working Conditions	1,590	1,590	2,436	2,436	2,594	2,594					1,432		Amt per school plus amt per teacher
Nutrition	260	260	585	585	845	845					-		Based on enrollment
Bilingual Learning Environ.	-	-	-	-	-	-					-		
Wellness Grant	1,153	1,153	1,811	1,811	1,811	1,811					1,154		Based on proposal to WCS
Positive Learning	-	-	-	-	-	-					-		
Co/Extra Trips	126	347	659	740	786	1,087					-		Based on enrollment and any adjustments
PSSC	84	84	440	440	525	525					-		Based on enrollment
Total	6,249	11,775	21,756	23,771	25,419	30,860					2,585	4,686	

Facilities Costs	Coles Island Actual Costs		C/CNCs Est Future Costs		Estimated Savings		Comments
	2013-14	2013-14	2013-14	2013-14	2013-14	2013-14	
Electricity	30,138	62,649	63,000	29,787			
Garbage Removal	1,912	9,968	10,350	1,912			Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure
Ground Maintenance	5,952	8,670	11,140	5,952			Contract changed from 13-14 to 14-15; change is regardless of school closure
Cleaning Supplies	359	3,859	4,060	158			
Minor Repairs	12,473	21,212	22,000	11,685			
Total	50,834	106,359	110,550	49,495			